

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF CITY OF PARRAMATTA COUNCIL HELD IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBER AT 5 PARRAMATTA SQUARE, PARRAMATTA ON MONDAY, 5 DECEMBER 2022 AT 6:30PM

---

PRESENT

The Lord Mayor, Councillor Donna Davis and Councillors Phil Bradley, Kellie Darley, Pierre Esber, Michelle Garrard, Henry Green, Ange Humphries, Cameron Maclean, Paul Noack, Sameer Pandey, Dr Patricia Prociv, Dan Siviero, Georgina Valjak and Donna Wang.

1. OPENING MEETING

The Lord Mayor, Councillor Donna Davis, opened the meeting at 6:39PM.

2. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT TO TRADITIONAL OWNERS OF LAND

The Lord Mayor, acknowledged the Burramattagal people of The Darug Nation as the traditional owners of this land, and paid respect to their ancient culture and to their elders past, present and emerging.

3. WEBCASTING ANNOUNCEMENT

The Lord Mayor, advised that this public meeting is being recorded and streamed live on the internet. The recording will also be archived and made available on Council's website.

The Lord Mayor further advised that all care will be taken to maintain privacy, however as a visitor in the public gallery, the public should be aware that their presence may be recorded.

4. GENERAL RECORDING OF MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT

As per Council's Code of Meeting Practice, the recording of the Council Meeting by the public using any device, audio or video, is only permitted with Council permission. Recording a Council Meeting without permission may result in the individual being expelled from the Meeting.

5. APOLOGIES AND APPLICATIONS FOR LEAVE OF ABSENCE OR ATTENDANCE BY AUDIO-VISUAL LINK BY COUNCILLORS

PROCEDURAL MOTION

4106 RESOLVED (Esber/Siviero)

**That** the Council accept the apologies of Councillor Wearne due to personal reasons be accepted and leave of absence granted.

6. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

SUBJECT: Minutes of the Council Meeting held on 28 November 2022

4107 RESOLVED (Noack/Bradley)

**That** the minutes of the Council meeting held on 28 November 2022 be received and noted, and that such minutes be taken as a true record of the proceedings of that meeting, subject to the following amendments to Item 11.1:

- 1) Note that Councillor Noack voted for the rescission; and
- 2) the Motion was moved by Councillor Esber and seconded by Councillor Humphries.

## 7. DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

There were no Declarations of Interest made at this meeting.

## 8. MINUTES OF THE LORD MAYOR

8.1 SUBJECT Condolence Motion for Carlingford High School student Calvin Wijeweera

REFERENCE F2022/00105 - D08793154

REPORT OF Lord Mayor, Councillor Donna Davis

4108 RESOLVED (Davis/Esber)

- (a) **That Council** extend its deepest sympathies to the family and friends of Calvin Wijeweera, a Carlingford High School student who was killed on Rembrandt Street Carlingford, on the morning of Thursday 1 December 2022;
- (b) **That** Council thank the first responders for their efforts in tragic circumstances;
- (c) **That** the Chamber hold a minute's silence as a mark of mourning and respect for the young life lost in this tragic accident; and
- (d) **Further, that** the Lord Mayor write a letter of condolence to Calvin Wijeweera's family and to the Principal, students and staff of Carlingford High School.

**Note: Council held a minutes' silence**

8.2 SUBJECT Live site activation across the City of Parramatta

REFERENCE F2022/00105 - D08793120

REPORT OF Lord Mayor, Councillor Donna Davis

4109      RESOLVED      (Davis/Garrard)

- (a)    **That** Council congratulate the City of Parramatta's City Engagement & Experience Team for the successful organisation of two World Cup live sites on Sunday 4 December 2022.
- (b)    **That** Council officers investigate and table a report in early 2023 on a framework for future planning for live activation sites across the City of Parramatta, to support major sporting and community events; and
- (c)    **Further, that** this report detail opportunities to leverage new infrastructure projects and resourcing needs associated with any proposed live site activities for Council's consideration.

## 9.    PUBLIC FORUM

9.1      SUBJECT      PUBLIC FORUM 1: for Item 13.2 Rose Street Precinct, Epping

REFERENCE    F2022/00105 - D08790650

**FROM**                      Vinh Cuong Pham

Dear Lord and Councillors,

I'd like to discuss the impact of the land rezoning (known as the Rose Street Precinct, Epping).

The rezoning will impact heavily on our livelihood and the value of our property (93 Essex Street Epping).

Thanks in advance for your consideration.

### **STAFF RESPONSE**

No staff response provided.

9.2      SUBJECT      PUBLIC FORUM 2: for Item 13.2 Rose Street Precinct, Epping

REFERENCE    F2022/00105 - D08790660

**FROM**                      Ralph Allen

Thank you for your letter of 30 November advising of a one-day window to comment on this item, which is compliant with the ambition of the outlined consultation period.

Background

The background section of the document and the March 14 comments in Attachment 1 gloss over one of the main triggers for resident responses.

The re-zoning materials developed by Hornsby Council and circulated for exhibition proposed that the south side of Maida Road be developed for low rise townhouses etc and provided diagrams and other materials to this effect.

Hornsby Council did not include FSR controls in their work and as a result much larger buildings were eventually permissible and have mostly been built. The process failure meant there was no effective consultation and the Epping community, and especially within the precinct, was blindsided by the negative impacts of what are technically poor planning outcomes.

The recognition of and concern to ameliorate the planning authority's failure is a thread in many of council's earlier materials, for example the staff recommendation at Background point 6.

As there are still two business days before the evening of 5th December council officers should have time to fact check the Hornsby Council materials and confirm to councillors if they deem necessary. It is suggested that the report would be improved and more accurate if this aspect was included or council could confirm it was fully aware in the minutes.

It is also suggested that the documentation would be more professional from the council's perspective if the petition sent to the three ward councillors, signed by nearly all residents of the precinct, formally presented to and noted by council at its meeting on 25 March 2019, was recorded in the background or the attachment. We thank Cr Davis for presenting.

#### Site Description

The site description language and diagrams do not include topography. Given that interface issues are made worse by steep gradients to the north (and ameliorated to Brigg Road to the south), and the paper includes a crude 1 in 100 flood map, the absence of this information is a material shortcoming.

It should be a simple matter to prepare a sentence or two and drop in a diagram. Interesting resources such as Open Street Map are now readily available online which show how high the south side of Brigg Rd is and the relatively small catchment area up Chesterfield Rd that drains through the precinct.

#### Current Strategic Planning Framework

The report includes some comment on the Urban Activation Precinct process and surrounds.

It is suggested the councillors should be made aware in this section of the report of the current approach to planning for the properties on the other side of the paling fence – the south side of Maida Rd.

Recollection is that the buildings currently standing on the south side of Maida Rd would usually require R4 zoning as defined by council, but that the recommendation of new planning documents was to assign an R3 zoning with an 0.8 FSR to enable further development.

If this is still planned, users of the documents would falsely infer that there is a graduated development / build height regime from the Epping railway station to the precinct.

It could also mislead users concerning the diversity of housing types that exist in Epping, as one of the stated claims of the R3 classification was in fact to provide diversity in housing stock. R4 would therefore have been more truthful and better from any administrative perspective

Given the short time available to prepare a response I haven't had time to research the current status of this work, no doubt a member of your team can quickly provide you with the necessary information.

The main point might be that council is in fact completely comfortable with and supportive of current built forms as between the precinct and Maida Rd, which is essentially the position of the report and its signatories? And fully supportive of development of the remaining site in Maida Rd? Notwithstanding what good planning practice might look like elsewhere?

Flood risk

Interesting to see this council's flood mapping information, I think for the first time.

I note the affected blocks are fully shaded although many have a substantial fall front to back, so water clears rapidly and could not impact much of each site.

Many of the blocks on Forest Grove have or will have significant residential towers on them and I'm sure we all hope sufficient hydraulic work has been undertaken – that might be an issue for your point 25.

For the precinct the catchment area on the western side of the line that flows through is quite small – Victoria Street and Rawson Street would be close to the limits ?

It is suggested that including topographical information would significantly improve the usefulness of the diagram.

The idea that an externally commissioned report would have been / would be acceptable for council purposes I think is new information would have been a non-combative inclusion earlier in this council's process



**That** the meeting be adjourned for a short recess.

**Note: The meeting was adjourned at 7:10pm for a short recess.**

The meeting resumed at 7:17pm with the following Councillors attendance: The Lord Mayor, Councillor Donna Davis and Councillors Phil Bradley, Kellie Darley, Pierre Esber, Michelle Garrard, Henry Green, Ange Humphries, Cameron Maclean, Paul Noack, Sameer Pandey (Deputy Lord Mayor), Dr Patricia Prociv, Dan Siviero, Georgina Valjak and Donna Wang.

10. PETITIONS

There were no petitions tabled at this meeting.

11. RESCISSION MOTIONS

Nil

12. REPORTS TO COUNCIL - FOR NOTATION

12.1        SUBJECT        DEFERRED ITEM: Variations to Standards under Clause 4.6 of Parramatta LEP 2011, Auburn LEP 2010, Holroyd LEP 2013, The Hills LEP 2012, Hornsby LEP 2013 (Deferred from the 14 November Council meeting)

REFERENCE   F2022/00105 - D08788623

REPORT OF   Group Manager - Development and Traffic Services

4111        RESOLVED        (Pandey/Darley)

**That** the report be received and noted.

*In accordance with section 375A of the Local Government Act a Division of votes is recorded on this planning matter.*

The report moved by Councillor Pandey and seconded by Councillor Darley was CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

*DIVISION        A division was called, the result being:-*

*AYES:*            Councillors Bradley, Darley, Davis, Esber, Garrard, Green, Humphries, Maclean, Noack, Pandey, Prociv, Siviero, Valjak and Wang.

13. REPORTS TO COUNCIL - FOR COUNCIL DECISION

13.1        SUBJECT        2023 Annual Community Grants

REFERENCE   F2022/00105 - D08730428

REPORT OF   Community Capacity Building Manager

4112      RESOLVED      (Pandey/Wang)

- (a) **That** Council notes the applications received in the annual round of the 2023 Community Grants Program in **Attachment 1**.
- (b) **That** Council notes the status of grants made in the quarterly Community Grants Program and Parramatta Representative Sports Grant in **Attachment 2**.
- (c) **That** Council adopts the expenditure recommended by the Grants Committee for the 2023 Community Grants in **Attachment 3**.
- (d) **That** Council endorses three Creative Skills Development Grant offers of \$10,000 for the following applicants:
  - 1. Miss Lucy Clements
  - 2. Ms Thelma Thomas
  - 3. Dr Stephen Sewell.
- (e) That Council endorses a Creative Fellowship Grant offer of \$20,000 for Ms Keg de Souza.
- (f) That the \$9,885.96 remaining in unallocated funds be re-allocated into the 2023/24 financial year, to support the development of a Youth Focused initiative, within the 2023/24 Community Grants Program, and that Councillors be consulted within 3 months' time at a Councillor Workshop on the developments of the reallocation of unallocated funds.
- (g) **Further that**, Council delegates authority to the Chief Executive Officer to disburse funds to the recipients in paragraphs (c) and (d) above.

**Note: Page 25 of the Agenda reads the Sydney Improvised Music Associates is partially funded.**

13.2      SUBJECT      Rose Street Precinct, Epping

REFERENCE      F2022/00105 - D08733270

REPORT OF      Senior Project Officer Land Use; Team Leader Land Use Planning

4113      RESOLVED      (Maclean/Esber)

- (a) **That** Council does not proceed to prepare a drainage analysis to support consideration of amendments to the planning controls that apply to the Rose Street Precinct, Epping for the following reasons:
  - 1. Amendments to the planning controls for the Rose Street Precinct would have no strategic merit as the area is not required to contribute to meeting Council's adopted housing



targets to 2036 and therefore the amendments sought would be inconsistent with Council's Local Strategic Planning Statement and Local Housing Strategy.

2. Council's Local Strategic Planning Statement seeks to retain the local character of existing low density residential areas that are not currently identified to help meet housing growth targets, which are to be protected from the encroachment of high-density development.

- (b) **Further, that** Council writes to the landowners within the Rose Street Precinct, Epping and surrounding area advising them of Council's decision.

*In accordance with section 375A of the Local Government Act a Division of votes is recorded on this planning matter.*

The report moved by Councillor Maclean and seconded by Councillor Esber was CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

*DIVISION            A division was called, the result being:-*

*AYES:*                Councillors Bradley, Darley, Davis, Esber, Garrard, Green, Humphries, Maclean, Noack, Pandey, Prociv, Siviero, Valjak and Wang.

13.3      SUBJECT        Draft Loan Borrowing Policy for Public Exhibition

REFERENCE   F2022/00105 - D08734029

REPORT OF   Policy Officer

4114      RESOLVED       (Esber/Garrard)

- (a) **That** the draft Loan Borrowing Policy be placed on public exhibition for a period of 28 days.
- (b) **That** Council authorises the Chief Executive Officer to make any necessary editorial and content changes to the draft Loan Borrowing Policy for public exhibition to give effect to Council's resolution.
- (c) **Further, that** staff prepare a report to Council following the exhibition period.

13.4      SUBJECT        Review of Library Opening Hours

REFERENCE   F2022/00105 - D08765769

REPORT OF   Library Services Manager

4115 RESOLVED (Esber/Bradley)

- (a) **That** Council adopt revised Library Opening Hours across the City of Parramatta Library Network, as recommended below:

Library	Mon	Tues	Wed	Thurs	Fri	Sat	Sun	Hours	
<b>Carlingford</b>	9.30-5	9.30-5	9.30-8	9.30-5	9.30-5	9.30-12		43	+5.0
<b>Constitution Hill</b>	9.30-5	9.30-5	9.30-5	9.30-8	9.30-5	9.30-5	-	48	+7.5
<b>Dundas</b>	9.30-5	9.30-8	9.30-5	9.30-5	9.30-5	9.30-12	-	43	+2.5
<b>Epping</b>	9.30-5	9.30-8	9.30-8	9.30-8	9.30-5	9.30-5	2-5	57	+7.5
<b>Ermington</b>	9.30-5	9.30-5	9.30-8	9.30-5	9.30-5	9.30-12	-	43	+5.5
<b>Parramatta</b>	9-8	9-8	9-8	9-8	9-5	9-5	9-5	68	+6.0
<b>Wentworth Point</b>	9.30-5	9.30-8	9.30-8	9.30-8	9.30-5	9.30-5	2-5	57	+13
<b>Newington</b>	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0	-7.0
<b>Total Hours all Libraries</b>								<b>359</b>	<b>+40</b>

- (b) **That** the Newington lending facility be replaced by longer opening times at the Wentworth Point Library, promotion of the Home Library Service to Newington residents and through the provision of a book vending kiosk at the Newington Community Centre
- (c) **Further, that** the Library Service to report back to Council with a report on customer feedback on the revised opening hours in November 2023.

13.5 SUBJECT Exhibition Outcomes - Draft Planning Proposal, Draft Site-Specific DCP and Draft Planning Agreement - Holdmark Sites (Melrose Park South)

REFERENCE F2022/00105 - D08781705

APPLICANT/S Holdmark Property Group

OWNERS Holdmark Property Group

REPORT OF Senior Project Officer

4116 RESOLVED (Noack/Humphries)

**That** Council defer the consideration of this matter to Ordinary Council Meeting on Monday 12 December 2022.

*In accordance with section 375A of the Local Government Act a Division of votes is recorded on this planning matter.*

The report moved by Councillor Noack and seconded by Councillor Humphries was CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

*DIVISION            A division was called, the result being:-*

*AYES:*                Councillors Bradley, Darley, Davis, Esber, Garrard, Green, Maclean, Noack, Pandey, Prociv, Siviero, Valjak and Wang.

**Note:**

1. **A question was taken on notice for this item.**
2. **Deputy Lord Mayor Cr Pandey assumed the role of Chair at 8:12pm.**
3. **Cr Humphries retired from the Chamber at 8:35pm and did not return.**
4. **Lord Mayor assumed the role of Chair at 8:40pm.**

13.6        SUBJECT        DEFERRED ITEM: Night Time Economy Diversification Grants 2022/23 (Deferred from 28 November 2022 Council meeting)

REFERENCE   F2022/00105 - D08787529

REPORT OF   Project Officer

4117        RESOLVED        (Esber/Pandey)

- (a) **That** Council endorses the scope and guidelines for the Night Time Economy Diversification Grants for 2022/2023 provided at **Attachment 1**.
- (b) **That** the Chief Executive Officer be authorised to make any minor edits to the Grant Guidelines at **Attachment 1** of a non-policy nature, prior to the opening of the application round of the Night Time Economy Diversification Grants for 2022/2023.
- (c) **That** the Chief Executive Officer be delegated authority to consider and endorse to determine the recommendations of the assessment panel.
- (d) **Further, that** a Councillor briefing note detailing the outcomes of the Night Time Economy Diversification Grants Scheme is prepared at the close of the acquittal period in November 2023.

14. NOTICES OF MOTION

Nil

15. QUESTIONS WITH NOTICE

15.        SUBJECT        Questions Taken on Notice - 28 November 2022 Council Meeting

REFERENCE   F2022/00105 - D08786996

REPORT OF   Governance Manager

Item 12.1 City of Parramatta Council Annual Report 2021/22

During discussion on Item 12.1 City of Parramatta Council Annual Report 2021/22, Councillor Bradley asked the following question:

*What components of the budget were cut in the environmental sustainable expenditure? Last year's budget was \$3 for every \$100 and now it is being cut to \$1 for every \$100.*

*Acting Director City Strategy:*

The financial snapshot provided in the 'For every \$100...' section represents an indicative proportional allocation across Council's total budget, but does not reflect 'real' increases or decreases in dollar terms across years.

The infographic is intended to provide a simple, community friendly breakdown of where our annual funding is allocated, however cannot be used as a comparison of real expenditure from year to year.

For instance, in years where Council has increased spending on major projects, property or infrastructure, the total proportion spent on other categories will appear smaller even if actual spending in these categories has remained stable.

In the case of "Environment & Sustainability", this spend should be reviewed in conjunction with the "Waste Management" spend as there have been some reclassifications in some of the expense categories across years. However, the overall combined spend across these two categories continues to go up year-on-year, and is budgeted to increase significantly further in FY23.

	Actual \$		Budget \$
Expense Category	FY2021	FY2022	FY2023
C676 - Waste and Sustainability	6,632,495	6,211,526	9,819,631
C641 - Cleansing	7,799,066	7,333,387	8,642,104
C630 - Domestic Waste Management	32,988,191	35,665,087	44,949,561
C646 - Commercial Waste Management	532,055	489,169	608,849
<b>Total Environment Sustainability &amp; Waste Management</b>	<b>47,951,807</b>	<b>49,699,169</b>	<b>64,020,145</b>

	Actual \$	
Share in \$ 100 spend	2021	2022
Environment Sustainability	4	1
Waste Management	10	9
<b>Total share in \$100 spend</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>11</b>

These figures demonstrate that real expenditure has remained stable with a slight increase between FY21 and FY22, though it represented a smaller proportion of Council's overall spend in FY22. This is because significant spend on major works and 'one off' property projects including PHIVE,

Parramatta Aquatic Centre, 9 Wentworth Street and others, skewed the overall proportional representation of all other categories in this year.

Item 12.1 City of Parramatta Council Annual Report 2021/22

During discussion on Item 12.1 City of Parramatta Council Annual Report 2021/22, Councillor Bradley asked the following question:

*What are the projections for the next five years to restore those cuts in environmental sustainability particularly as our Strategic Plan highlights the importance for green as one of our six major goals as provided by the community and when the community continue to provide green spaces as their number one issue?*

*Acting Director City Strategy:*

As outlined in the previous response, there have been no cuts to Environment & Sustainability spending and therefore there is no projection or plan of the nature described in this question.

Item 12.1 City of Parramatta Council Annual Report 2021/22

During discussion on Item 12.1 City of Parramatta Council Annual Report 2021/22, Councillor Bradley asked the following question:

*Councillors have previously looked at having culture as a stand-alone item and not to be put together with parks and recreation so Councillors could specify the amount that was actually spent on culture. Why have staff not actioned having culture separate from parks and recreation?*

*Acting Director City Strategy:*

Staff are not aware of a specific directive to separate Culture spend from Parks and Recreation in the 'For every \$100...' infographic, but have now noted it to explore in future versions of this section.

While this infographic provides a very high level indicative view of Council's total expenditure, there may be many other ways to 'categorise' Council's spending. Staff highly encourage interested Councillors and community to explore Council's more detailed budgets, quarterly budget reviews, and annual financial statements for more detailed breakdown of spending.

**Note: Prior to moving into Closed Session, the Lord Mayor invited members of the public gallery to make representations as to why any item had been included in Closed Session. No member of the gallery wished to make representations.**

**Note: Cr Prociv retired from the Chamber at 8:49pm and returned at 8:50pm.**

16. CLOSED SESSION

4118      RESOLVED      (Esber/Noack)

**That** members of the press and public be excluded from the meeting of the Closed Session and access to the correspondence and reports relating to the items considered during the course of the Closed Session be withheld. This action is taken in accordance with Section 10A(s) of the Local Government Act, 1993 as the items listed come within the following provisions:-

- 1 Tender 23/2022 Installation of Traffic Control Signals and Associated Work – Hill Road at Bennelong Parkway, Wentworth Point. (D08692348) - *This report is confidential in accordance with section 10A (2) (d) of the Local Government Act 1993 as the report contains commercial information of a confidential nature that would, if disclosed (i) prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied it; or (ii) confer a commercial advantage on a competitor of the Council; or (iii) reveal a trade secret.*

16.1        SUBJECT        Tender 23/2022 Installation of Traffic Control Signals and Associated Work – Hill Road at Bennelong Parkway, Wentworth Point

REFERENCE    ITT-23/2022-02 - D08692348

REPORT OF    Manager Capital Projects

4119        RESOLVED        (Noack/Bradley)

- (a) **That** Council approve appointment of the preferred proponent for the installation of Traffic Control Signals and associated work at the intersection of Hill Road and Bennelong Parkway, Wentworth Point, for \$2,904,977.30 (excl. GST).
- (b) **That** all unsuccessful tenderers be advised of Council's decision in this matter
- (c) **Further, that** Council delegate authority to the Chief Executive Officer to finalise and execute all necessary documents.

#### PROCEDURAL MOTION

4120        RESOLVED        (Esber/Bradley)

**That** the meeting resume in Open Session.

**Note: Question was taken on notice on the Labor Government's decision on Stage 2 the Light Rail.**


#### 17. REPORTS OF RESOLUTIONS PASSED IN CLOSED SESSION

The Chief Executive Officer read out the resolutions for Item 16.1.

#### 18. CONCLUSION OF MEETING

The meeting terminated at 8:52pm.

THIS PAGE AND THE PRECEDING PAGES ARE THE MINUTES OF THE  
ORDINARY/EXTRAORDINARY COUNCIL MEETING HELD ON Monday, 5  
December 2022 AND CONFIRMED ON Monday, 12 December 2022.



---

Chairperson