



**CITY OF
PARRAMATTA**

MINUTES

**Ordinary Council Meeting
Monday, 12 February 2024**

6.30pm

**Council Chamber
Level 4, PHIVE
Parramatta Square, Parramatta**

COUNCIL MEMBERS IN ATTENDANCE

The Lord Mayor, Councillor Pierre Esber and Councillors Phil Bradley, Kellie Darley, Michelle Garrard, Henry Green, Cameron MacLean, Paul Noack, Sameer Pandey, Deputy Lord Mayor, Dr Patricia Prociv, Dan Siviero, Georgina Valjak, Donna Wang and Lorraine Wearne (online).

COUNCIL STAFF IN ATTENDANCE

Chief Executive Officer - Gail Connolly, Executive Director City Engagement and Experience - Angela Jones-Blayney, Executive Director Finance and Information - John Angilley, Executive Director City Planning and Design - Jennifer Concato, Executive Director Community Services - Jonathan Greig, Executive Director City Assets & Operations – George Bounassif, Acting Executive Director People Culture and Workplace – Sarah McAskill, Chief Technology Officer - John Crawford, Chief Governance & Risk Officer - Roxanne Thornton, Chief Financial Officer - Amit Sharma, Chief of Staff - Justin Mulder, ICT Strategy and Partnering Manager - Ian Vong.

1. OPENING MEETING

The Lord Mayor, Councillor Esber opened the meeting at 6:32pm

2. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT TO TRADITIONAL OWNERS OF LAND

The Lord Mayor acknowledged the Burramattagal people of The Dharug Nation as the traditional owners of this land, and paid respect to their ancient culture and to their elders past, present and emerging.

3. WEBCASTING ANNOUNCEMENT

The Lord Mayor advised that this public meeting is being recorded and streamed live on the internet. The recording will also be archived and made available on Council's website.

The Lord Mayor further advised that all care will be taken to maintain privacy, however as a visitor in the public gallery, the public should be aware that their presence may be recorded.

4. GENERAL RECORDING OF MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT

As per Council's Code of Meeting Practice, the recording of the Council Meeting by the public using any device, audio or video, is only permitted with Council permission. Recording a Council Meeting without permission may result in the individual being expelled from the Meeting.

5. APOLOGIES AND APPLICATIONS FOR LEAVE OF ABSENCE OR ATTENDANCE BY AUDIO-VISUAL LINK BY COUNCILLORS

RESOLVED: Councillor Noack and Councillor Garrard

- (a) That an apology on behalf of Councillor Humphries and be accepted and a leave of absence granted.
- (b) That an apology be noted for the late arrival of Councillor Siviero.
- (c) That Councillor Wearne be permitted to attend this meeting by audio-visual link.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Councillors agreed to send flowers to Councillor Humphries who is unwell.

5. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

Minutes of the Council Meeting held on 11 December 2023

4657

RESOLVED: Councillor Noack and Councillor Pandey

That the minutes be taken as read and accepted as a true record of the Meeting.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Minutes of the Extraordinary Council Meeting held on 29 January 2024

4658

RESOLVED: Councillor Garrard and Councillor Wang

That the minutes be taken as read and accepted as a true record of the Meeting.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

6. DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

There were no disclosures of interest.

PROCEDURAL MOTION DEALING WITH ITEMS BY EXCEPTION

RESOLVED: Councillor MacLean and Councillor Noack

That in accordance with Section 13 of Council's Code of Meeting Practice, the Order of Business be amended to deal with the following items by exception:

- Item 12.1 Investment Report for November 2023
- Item 12.2 Investment Report for December 2023
- Item 13.2 Casual Vacancy in Civic Office - Resignation of Councillor Donna Davis MP (Application to Minister for Local Government to Dispense with By-Election
- Item 15.1 Questions Taken on Notice at the 11 December 2023 Council Meeting

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

12.1 **Investment Report for November 2023**
(Report of Tax and Treasury Accountant)

4659

RESOLVED: Councillor MacLean and Councillor Noack

That Council receive and note the Investment Report for November 2023.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

12.2 **Investment Report for December 2023**
(Report of Tax and Treasury Accountant)

4660

RESOLVED: Councillor MacLean and Councillor Noack

That Council receive and note the Investment Report for December 2023.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

13.2 **Casual Vacancy in Civic Office - Resignation of Councillor Donna Davis MP (Application to Minister for Local Government to Dispense with By-Election)**

(Report of Executive Director Finance & Information)

4661

RESOLVED: Councillor MacLean and Councillor Noack

That Council make an application to the Minister for Local Government for an Order that the current vacancy in the office of councillor not be filled.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

15.1 **Questions Taken on Notice at the 11 December 2023 Council Meeting**

(Report of Council Secretariat & Policy Officer)

4662

QUESTIONS WITH NOTICE

Councillor Garrard asked a question on Item 13.12 Submission on Proposed Amendment to the Department of Planning and Environment - Homebush Bay West Development Control Plan (DCP) 2004 (for 16 Burroway Road and part 5 Footbridge Boulevard, Wentworth Point (Block H)).

- [In Attachment 3 under the actual VPA, I am unable to read what the sticky notes say, can I please be advised what they say? There's at least 50-100 of them.](#)

Executive Director City Planning and Design Response:

An amended version of Attachment 3 is attached to the report and it includes the details of the 'sticky notes' that are shown within in the version of the draft Planning Agreement that was originally attached to the report. The 'sticky notes' were inserted in the draft Planning Agreement by the applicant's lawyer to assist with the preparation of the document.

Deputy Lord Mayor **Councillor Prociv** asked a question on Item 13.2 Traffic Engineering Advisory Group - 8 November 2023 – Minutes (Item 2311 line marking).

- [What is to be done when the line marking starts falling apart, in particular in Harris Park?](#)

Executive Director City Planning and Design Response:

The line marking in Harris Park that had failed is in Albion Street and was replaced in January 2024. This line marking was installed

incorrectly and was replaced as part of a defects liability process with no additional charge to Council.

Deputy Lord Mayor **Councillor Prociv** asked a question on Item 13.4 CBD Footpaths Audit and Pavement Replacement Program.

- [Is there anything west of Pitt Street not being considered in the CBD Footpath Priority Plan?](#)

Executive Director City Assets and Operations Response:

The footpaths west of Pitt Street have not been considered in the current CBD Footpath Priority Plan. This was outside of the scope of this current audit, however these footpaths will be considered in the future audit work.

Councillor Garrard asked three (3) questions on Item 13.4 CBD Footpaths Audit and Pavement Replacement Program.

- [Why isn't the footpath on Wigram Street, between Parkes and Hassall Streets, in the report?](#)

Executive Director City Assets and Operations Response:

Wigram Street footpath between Parkes and Hassell Street is included in the report, and is identified in Table 2 located on page 3.

- [Investigate what works will be completed by developers?](#)

Executive Director City Assets and Operations Response:

The developer will complete works that have been specified in the DA conditions. This includes but not limited to the footpath, kerb and gutter, driveway crossing etc. The footpath fronting the 12 Parkes Street property (corner building which is under construction) will be constructed by the developer and the remaining section towards Hassell Street will be completed by Council.

- [Is the footpath on O'Connell Street, between Campbell and the Great Western Highway, concrete or concrete paver?](#)

Executive Director City Assets and Operations Response:

Based on Council's public domain guideline, the footpath is designated to be concrete pavers.

Councillor Darley asked a question on Item 15.1 Council Meeting Live Data Stream.

- Are they unique visits? Do they tune in back and forth?

Executive Director City Engagement and Experience Response:

Based on the 11 December 2023 Council Live Data Stream results are as below:

Watching the live stream: 125 unique users (a unique ID is given to each individual user)

- Total views: There was a total of 360 views.
- Video paused: 54 times
- Users who completed the video: 33
- Average engagement time per user: 1 minute and 38 seconds.

QUESTIONS WITH NOTICE – CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS (ITEMS 16.2, 16.3, 16.4 AND 16.5)

Councillor Pandey asked two (2) questions on Item 16.2 Expression of Interest on Retail 6 - Parramatta Square.

Answer provided at Confidential Attachment 2.

Councillor Pandey asked a question on Confidential Item 16.3 Tender Exemption – Engagement of Property Strategy Consultant.

Answer provided at Confidential Attachment 2.

Councillor Pandey asked a question on Confidential Item 16.4 Tender Exemption – Engagement of 9 Wentworth Consultant.

Answer provided at Confidential Attachment 2.

Councillor Pandey asked a question on Confidential Item 16.5 LATE REPORT- Partnership Proposal between the City of Parramatta and Parramatta Eels (2024-2026).

Answer provided at Confidential Attachment 2.

Councillor Bradley asked a question on Confidential Item 16.5 LATE REPORT- Partnership Proposal between the City of Parramatta and Parramatta Eels (2024-2026).

Answer provided at Confidential Attachment 2.

Councillor Darley asked a question on Confidential Item 16.5 LATE REPORT- Partnership Proposal between the City of Parramatta and Parramatta Eels (2024-2026).

Answer provided at Confidential Attachment 2.

8. MINUTES OF THE LORD MAYOR

8.1 **Vale The Hon. Michael Egan AO**

(Lord Mayor Councillor Pierre Esber)

4663

RESOLVED: Lord Mayor Councillor Esber and Councillor Noack

- (a) That Council acknowledge the death of the Hon. Michael Egan AO, former NSW Treasurer, Leader of the Government, Leader of the Opposition, Ministers for Energy, Gaming and Racing, and State and Regional Development, and Member for Cronulla, on 1 February 2024.
- (b) That Council express its sincere condolences to the Hon. Michael Egan AO's family and friends at this sad time.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

8.2 **Vale Ms Trish Keating**

(Lord Mayor Councillor Pierre Esber)

4664

RESOLVED: Lord Mayor Councillor Esber and Councillor Noack

- (a) That Council acknowledge the death of Trish Keating on 31 December 2023, former Auburn City Council employee, Secretary of the City of Parramatta Art Society and Old Government House and Experiment Farm volunteer and National Trust Parramatta Branch Member.
- (b) That Council express its sincere condolences to Trish Keating's family and friends at this sad time.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

8.3 **2024 Citizen of the Year Awards and 2024 Australia Day Honours**

(Lord Mayor Councillor Pierre Esber)

4665

RESOLVED: Lord Mayor Councillor Esber and Councillor Garrard

- (a) That Council congratulate the winners of the City of Parramatta's 2024 Citizen of the Year Awards, who received their awards at the ceremony held at Parramatta Park on 25 January 2024:
- a. Julie Crane – Citizen of the Year
 - b. Nass Aoun – Young Citizen of the Year
 - c. Ronda Gaffey – Senior Citizen of the Year
 - d. Support Organisation for Homeless and Asylum Seekers (SOHAS) – Community Group Award
- (b) That Council congratulate the following recipients of the Governor General's 2024 Australia Day Honours for their contributions to the Parramatta community, being:
- a. Officer of the Order of Australia (AO)
 - i. The late Emeritus Professor Robin William King AO
 - b. Member (AM) in the General Division
 - i. Emeritus Professor Michael John Eyles AM
 - ii. Professor Christopher Gerard Maher AM
 - iii. The Honourable Justice Grant Theo Riethmuller AM
 - c. Medal (OAM) in the General Division
 - i. Mrs Lilian Margaret Ries OAM
 - ii. Mr Peter Bacha OAM
- (c) That the Lord Mayor write a letter of congratulations to the recipients of the 2024 Australia Day Honours.
- (d) That Council celebrates the success of the popular City of Parramatta Australia Day events held on 25 and 26 January 2024 and congratulates all staff involved on their fantastic efforts.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Councillor Noack requested the Lord Mayor's permission to move his Notice of Motion which is Item 14.3 of this meeting. The Lord Mayor agreed to the request.

14.3 **Congratulations to Mr Peter Bacha OAM**

(Motion by Councillor Noack)

4666

RESOLVED: Councillor Noack and Councillor Garrard

That Council congratulate Mr Peter Bacha OAM for his well-deserved OAM Honour and his tireless work as a volunteer for the Rydalmere Lions Football Club, and other areas of community service, as he is an inspiration to the Parramatta community.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

8.4 **Acknowledgement of Service - Ms Donna Davis MP**

(Lord Mayor Councillor Pierre Esber)

4667

RESOLVED: Lord Mayor Councillor Esber and Councillor Darley

- (a) That Council acknowledge the resignation of Ms Donna Davis MP from the City of Parramatta after serving as Councillor for seven years, including as Lord Mayor from January 2022 to May 2023; and
- (b) That Council thank Ms Donna Davis MP for her service to the community and congratulate her for all she has achieved.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

8.5 **Thank You to Council Staff for Working During the Christmas Close Down and New Year Period**

(Lord Mayor Councillor Pierre Esber)

4668

RESOLVED: Lord Mayor Councillor Esber and Councillor Garrard

That Council thank the City of Parramatta staff who continued to work and provide services to our community over the Christmas close down and New Year period.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

8.6 **Celebrating Lunar New Year – Year of the Dragon**

(Lord Mayor Councillor Pierre Esber)

4669

RESOLVED: Lord Mayor Councillor Esber and Councillor Wang

- (a) That Council celebrates the Lunar New Year, ushering in the Year of the Dragon and its significance to many diverse cultures and communities within the City of Parramatta.
- (b) That Council note the popular Lunar New Year festivities held on 10 February 2024 at Parramatta Square and Centenary Square from 4-10pm, featuring family friendly entertainment, culture and food such as dragon and lion dancing, music, lanterns and a giant interactive dragon installation.
- (c) That Council commends all staff involved in delivering the Lunar New Year event on 10 February and associated celebrations including calligraphy, stamp carving, textiles, amuletic cards, traditional food-making workshops and walking tours at PHIVE.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

8.7 **Opening of Oatlands Memorial Garden**

(Lord Mayor Councillor Pierre Esber)

4670

RESOLVED: Lord Mayor Councillor Esber and Councillor Garrard

- (a) That Council acknowledge the opening of permanent memorial garden honouring the four children who tragically died in a motor vehicle accident in Oatlands in 2020.
- (b) That Council note the actions taken by City of Parramatta to improve pedestrian safety on Bettington Road, Oatlands.
- (c) That Council staff investigate alternative options for the pedestrian safety barrier on Bettington Road, Oatlands to improve the visual amenity of the barrier whilst also ensuring relevant Australian Traffic Standards are met.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

9. PUBLIC FORUM

There were no speakers.

10. PETITIONS

Councillor Prociv tabled a petition for the Parramatta City Council to advocate for the residents of in relation to the Silverwater Business Centre the Post Office will close from the 24 February 2024.

Note: Councillor Prociv raised the same petition as a matter of urgency after Item 15.4.

Note: Councillor Siviero joined the meeting at 7.09pm.

11. RESCISSION MOTIONS

Nil

12. REPORTS TO COUNCIL - FOR NOTATION

12.3 Referral of Inspection Reports by Fire and Rescue NSW (Report of Team Leader Building Compliance)

4671

RESOLVED: Councillor Darley and Councillor MacLean

- (a) That Council notes the inspection reports from Fire and Rescue NSW (FRNSW), pursuant to Schedule 5, Part 8 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (EPA Act 1979).
- (b) That Council note FRNSW will be advised in due course of the ongoing actions taken by Council officers to address concerns identified by FRNSW.
- (c) That Council note the exercise of powers pursuant to Schedule 5, Part 8 (17) of the EPA Act, to give fire safety orders addressing fire safety measures to the buildings located at:
 - 22 Cowper Street, Parramatta
 - 128 Macquarie Street, Parramatta
 - 72 Great Western Highway, Parramatta

as outlined in this report and provide further notice of this determination to the Commissioner of FRNSW.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Councillor Pandey asked a question on Item 12.3 Referral of Inspection Reports by Fire and Rescue NSW which was taken on notice. Can we find out how many notices and orders have been issued in this term of Council regarding flammable cladding?

Councillor Bradley mentioned that work on flammable cladding in buildings around the City of Parramatta has been done. Can an update report on the progress on remedial work on buildings affected by the cladding recall be provided?

12.4 **Delegation of the Lord Mayor and Chief Executive Officer Exercised During the 2023/24 Recess Period**

(Report of Executive Officer)

4672

RESOLVED: Councillor Darley and Councillor Noack

- (a) That Council note the decisions exercised under delegated authority during the recess period, being Tuesday 12 December 2023 until Sunday 11 February 2024, contained within this report.
- (b) That this matter be deferred to allow the CEO to provide a report on financial expenditure incurred during previous recess periods throughout this term of Council.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Councillor Garrard asked a question on Item 12.4 Delegation of the Lord Mayor and Chief Executive Officer Exercised During the 2023/24 Recess Period which was taken on notice. Can staff provide detailed information on the benefits the position of Lord Mayor gets including the discretionary budget?

13. REPORTS TO COUNCIL - FOR COUNCIL DECISION

13.1 **Adoption of the Parramatta Bike Plan 2024**

(Report of Senior Project Officer Transport Planning)

4673

RESOLVED: Councillor Pandey and Councillor Noack

That this matter be deferred to a Councillor Workshop before the matter is considered further by Council.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

14. NOTICES OF MOTION

14.1 **Proposed Council Submission - Review of Section 83c of the Education Act 1990**

(Motion by Councillor Humphries)

4674

RESOLVED: Councillor Noack and Councillor Valjak

- (a) That Council authorise the Executive Director, City Planning and Design to lodge a submission on the NSW Government's Review of section 83C of the *Education Act 1990 (NSW)*.
- (b) That the submission outline Council's concern that the regulation of non-government schools should not preclude the ability of any school to assist in providing potentially valuable community uses and wider community benefits on non-government school land, such as the Hunts Creek connection identified in Council's Parramatta Bike Plan 2024.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Councillor Pandey asked a question on Item 14.1 Proposed Council Submission - Review of Section 83c of the Education Act 1990 which was taken on notice. Are there policies and procedures in place for Councillors to be privy to submissions made by staff on behalf of Council?

14.2 **Draft 2024/25 Budget - Proposed Capital Works Program Budget Increases**

(Motion by Councillor Garrard)

4675

MOTION: Councillor Garrard and Councillor Siviero

- (a) That the CEO commence a review of the existing capital works program to identify potential budget increases for consideration by Councillors during the 2024/2025 budget process, including but not limited to the program areas listed below:
 - Roads Renewal Program (current 3yr budget **\$30.756m**).
 - Kerb and Gutter Renewal Program (current 3yr budget **\$9.227m**).
 - Drainage Construction Program (current 3yr budget **\$6.338m**).
 - Footpaths Construction Program (current 3yr budget **\$6.598m**).
 - Footpath Renewal Program (current 3yr budget **\$5.167m**)

- Stormwater Drainage Renewal Program (current 3yr budget **\$4.921m**).
 - Roads To Recovery Program (current 3yr budget **\$3.956m**)
 - Playground Replacement Program (current 3yr budget **\$3.137m**).
 - Neighbourhood Improvement Program (current 3yr budget **\$6.080m**).
 - Sportsground Capital Improvement Program (current 3yr budget **\$1.492m**).
- (b) That the CEO provide a preliminary report regarding the proposed options to increase the abovementioned capital programs, to the Finance Committee as part of the 2024/2025 budget process.

AMENDMENT: Councillor Darley and DLM Councillor Prociv

- (a) That the CEO commence a review of the existing capital works program to identify potential budget changes for consideration by Councillors during the 2024/2025 budget process after careful consideration of the feedback from the Your Place, Your Voice! Community Workshops.
- (b) That the CEO provide a preliminary report regarding the proposed options to change the abovementioned capital programs, to the Finance Committee as part of the 2024/2025 budget process.
- (c) That the CEO provide Council with updated Asset Management Plans and Strategy as part of the 2024/2025 IP&R process.
- (d) That the CEO identify potential funding sources to accompany any proposed movements (increases) in the funding of program areas.

Record of Voting:

For the Amendment: Lord Mayor Councillor Esber, Deputy Lord Mayor, Councillor Prociv, Councillors Bradley, Darley and MacLean.

Against the Amendment: Councillors Garrard, Green, Noack, Pandey, Siviero, Valjak, Wang and Wearne.

On being put to the meeting, voting on the Amendment was five (5) votes FOR and eight (8) votes AGAINST. The Amendment was **LOST**.

RESOLVED: Councillor Garrard and Councillor Siviero

- (a) That the CEO commence a review of the existing capital works program to identify potential budget increases for consideration by Councillors during the 2024/2025 budget process, including but not limited to the program areas listed below:
- Roads Renewal Program (current 3yr budget **\$30.756m**).

- Kerb and Gutter Renewal Program (current 3yr budget **\$9.227m**).
- Drainage Construction Program (current 3yr budget **\$6.338m**).
- Footpaths Construction Program (current 3yr budget **\$6.598m**).
- Footpath Renewal Program (current 3yr budget **\$5.167m**)
- Stormwater Drainage Renewal Program (current 3yr budget **\$4.921m**).
- Roads To Recovery Program (current 3yr budget **\$3.956m**).
- Playground Replacement Program (current 3yr budget **\$3.137m**).
- Neighbourhood Improvement Program (current 3yr budget **\$6.080m**).
- Sportsground Capital Improvement Program (current 3yr budget **\$1.492m**).

- (b) That the CEO provide a preliminary report regarding the proposed options to increase the abovementioned capital programs, to the Finance Committee as part of the 2024/2025 budget process.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

14.3 **Congratulations to Mr Peter Bacha OAM**

(Motion by Councillor Noack)

This matter was addressed earlier in the meeting as detailed in these Minutes.

15. QUESTIONS WITH NOTICE

15.2 **Active Parramatta School Holidays Program**

(Report of Councillor Darley)

4676 **QUESTIONS WITH NOTICE**

1. [How many sessions \(by sports code/type\) have been provided at each school holiday program over the last year?](#)

Executive Director, Community Services response:

Council has collaborated with 40 different sporting codes to deliver 158 sessions over the last 12 months. Some of these sporting codes may be

well known and established codes with multiple sessions offered and others may be emerging or growing codes as shown in the table below:

Sport code by child participation	Number of sessions
Football/soccer	5
Dancing (recreational)	12
Basketball	2
Tennis	12
Athletics, track and field (includes jogging and running)	4
Rugby league	4
Netball	7
Australian football	2
Other (other codes and activity types)	110
TOTAL	158

2. What is the total number of kids that have attended each of our popular school holiday programs over the last year and what proportion were children from within the Parramatta LGA?

Executive Director, Community Services response:

In total 2,541 children attended the school holiday program in the last 12 months.

Holiday Period	# of activities	# of attendees
April 2023	38	507
July 2023	39	703
September 2023	41	606
January 2024	40	725
TOTAL	158	2,541

Of the 2,541 attendees, 1,858 (or 73%) reside in a postcode that is wholly or partially located within the Parramatta LGA.

3. Are the providers of each activity in our school holidays program paid or do they provide them for free?

Executive Director, Community Services response:

Both. In the last 12 months, 19 activities involved payment to the facilitator and 139 involved no payment.

15.3 **Additional Waste (Recycling) Collection Service at Christmas**
(Report of Councillor Darley)

4677 **QUESTIONS WITH NOTICE**

A number of other Councils in Greater Sydney provide an additional recycling collection for residents over the Christmas period, including Ryde, Fairfield, Penrith, Hawkesbury and Wingecarribee.

1. [Are there any reasons why City of Parramatta couldn't do this?](#)

Executive Director, City Assets & Operations response:

Council's new waste collection contract commences in November 2024 and provides additional recycling services for unit complexes.

However, any additional services (recycling or otherwise) across the entire LGA during the Christmas period would require a variation to the collection contract and would need to be negotiated and agreed to by the contractor. Council would also need to resolve to allocate additional funding towards the cost of additional services, which may also require an increase to ratepayers' annual waste charge.

2. [Roughly, what would be the associated cost of providing an additional recycling collection for each area after Christmas?](#)

Executive Director, City Assets & Operations response:

Publication of this commercial-in-confidence information would prejudice Council's negotiating position with the contractor should Council determine to proceed with an additional collection in the future.

Therefore, this information will be provided to Councillors confidentially on the Councillor portal.

3. [When would Council need to make a decision on this to ensure an additional recycling collection happens after Christmas this year?](#)

Executive Director, City Assets & Operations response:

Should Council's contractor agree to a contract variation (and should Council allocate the necessary additional funds to cover the cost) it is estimated that it would require a minimum of 6 months' notice from the date of variation to resource the additional recycling collection (trucks, staff, etc).

15.4 **Preparation of a Draft Tree Canopy Plan**
(Report of Councillor Darley)

4678 **QUESTIONS WITH NOTICE**

1. [As per the 2023/24 approved DPOP, Council's tree canopy plan was due to be completed by December 2023. What is the current status of the tree canopy plan?](#)

Executive Director, City Planning & Design response:

Work on the Canopy Plan has been delayed due to City Strategy's prioritisation of the Strategy Refresh process and the West Invest grant funding application and Deed requirements.

A Councillor workshop is scheduled in March 2024 to seek feedback and a subsequent Councillor workshop to present a draft Canopy Plan prior to seeking Council endorsement for exhibition is planned for May. It is anticipated that the draft Canopy Plan will be submitted to Council in June seeking endorsement for public exhibition.

2. [A new tree canopy dataset for Greater Sydney, which provides the most in-depth and detailed tree canopy imaging, was released by the NSW Government in late 2023. As a summary, what did this show has happened to the tree canopy across Parramatta LGA?](#)

Executive Director, City Planning & Design response:

Council staff have reviewed the 2022 data from the NSW Government, which was released by the NSW Government in 2023. It shows an overall canopy coverage of 25.3% for the LGA, an increase of 0.1% from 2019 and an increase of 2.5% from 2016.

However, as Councillors were previously advised in April 2023, these three data sets should not be used to understand the trend in canopy cover over time for Parramatta, for the following reasons:

- The NSW Government has used a different data capture and analysis methodology for each iteration of data making the results unable to be compared consistently.
- An assessment of the 2016 and 2019 data provided by RMIT found that the 2016 had a higher resolution aerial imagery and therefore more accurate canopy coverage data. This assessment is still relevant as the 2022 data has a lower resolution (less accurate) than the 2016 data.
- The variations from the methodologies will likely have a greater impact on differences in data than the actual canopy change over the time-period.

The NSW Government has committed to a consistent data capture methodology that will align with the 2022 data. This will allow the comparison of the 2022 data in the future.

3. Where is the most change in tree canopy occurring in the Parramatta LGA?

Executive Director, City Planning & Design response:

Staff have undertaken a comparison between the three NSW Government datasets in response to this request. The data and commentary is included below

MMB_Cat	2016	2019	2022	Change 2016-2019	Change 2019-2022	Net change 2016-2022	Observations:
Commercial	11.2%	10.5%	11.9%	-0.8%	1.4%	0.7%	- There are large fluctuations in canopy gain and loss between 2016-2019-2022 in Commercial, Industrial, Railway and Residential. This is considered unlikely based on Council officer reviews of aerial imagery. - There are significant gains in Environmental and Water. Council Officers expected increases in these areas but not at the rates indicated.
Education	37.8%	39.2%	40.6%	1.5%	1.3%	2.8%	
Environmental	54.4%	63.5%	64.5%	9.1%	1.0%	10.2%	
Hospital/Medical	19.6%	21.6%	22.4%	2.1%	0.8%	2.8%	
Industrial	10.4%	9.0%	10.1%	-1.4%	1.1%	-0.2%	
Other	15.5%	15.0%	17.0%	-0.5%	1.9%	1.5%	
Railway	13.1%	16.1%	11.1%	2.9%	-5.0%	-2.0%	
Recreational	36.9%	38.4%	40.6%	1.4%	2.3%	3.7%	
Residential	20.8%	24.4%	22.5%	3.6%	-1.9%	1.7%	
Road	14.7%	14.8%	17.9%	0.2%	3.1%	3.3%	
Water	42.0%	50.1%	52.6%	8.0%	2.5%	10.5%	
Total	22.7%	25.1%	25.3%	2.4%	0.1%	2.5%	

Based on the RMIT assessment, trends observed in the NearMap data and Council staff analysis, the reported changes in canopy coverage appear to be inaccurate don't reflect changes on the ground. Further information can be found in the presentation from the April 2023 Councillor workshop.

4. How many trees has Council planted in parks, along streets and on other public land annually for the last 3 years?

Executive Director, City Planning & Design response:

The table below provides a summary of the trees planted in parks and streets for the past 3 years.

FY	Number of trees	Program
20/21	1,000	Council Tree Planting Program
21/22	3,900	Parramatta Light Rail Tree Offset program + Greening our City program + Council Tree Planting Program
22/23	2,019	Parramatta Light Rail Tree Offset program+ Parks and Open Space + Capital Works Projects

Total	6,919
-------	-------

There are an additional 798 trees still to be planted as part the PLR Offset Program. This is anticipated to be completed by June 2024.

A further 250 plants associated with capital projects are scheduled to be planted by June 2024.

PROCEDURAL MOTION MATTER OF URGENCY

The Deputy Lord Mayor, Councillor Prociv requested to raise a Matter of Urgency under clause 9.3(b) of the Code of Meeting Practice, regarding the Closure of Australia Post at Olympic Park.

The Lord Mayor considered the matter to be urgent.

MATTER OF URGENCY CLOSURE OF AUSTRALIA POST AT OLYMPIC PARK

MATTER OR URGENCY - Closure of Australia Post at Olympic Park

4679 **RESOLVED:** Deputy Lord Mayor, Councillor Prociv and Councillor Darley

- (a) That Council write to The Hon Michelle Rowland MP, Minister for Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications and the Arts, Ms Sally Sitou MP, Federal Member for Reid, Ms Siobhan McKenna as Chair of the Australia Post and the affected franchisee, requesting that the decision to close Silverwater Business Hub Office on Saturday mornings be reversed.
- (b) That Council advocate for a permanent Australia Post facility to be established on the Olympic Peninsula to serve an increasing population.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

PROCEDURAL MOTION MOVE TO CLOSED SESSION

RESOLVED: Councillor Noack and Councillor MacLean

That at this time of the meeting, being 8.41pm, the Lord Mayor, Councillor Esber advised that the meeting would move into Closed Confidential Session to allow consideration of matters in Closed Session in accordance with Section 10A of the

Local Government Act 1993. Accordingly, members of the press and public are excluded from the closed session and access to the correspondence and reports relating to the items considered during the course of the Closed Session will be withheld.

This action is taken to discuss:

16.1 Tender Exemption - Maintenance, Management of Multi-level Carparks and Cash Collection Services (Report by Paid Parking and Contracts Manager)

This report is confidential in accordance with section 10A (2) (c) (d) of the Local Government Act 1993 as the report contains information that would, if disclosed, confer a commercial advantage on a person with whom the Council is conducting (or proposes to conduct) business; AND the report contains commercial information of a confidential nature that would, if disclosed (i) prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied it; or (ii) confer a commercial advantage on a competitor of the Council; or (iii) reveal a trade secret.

16.2 LATE REPORT – ITT10-2023 – Supply and installation of New Multi Level Carparking Technology and Maintenance (Report by Executive Director Finance and Information)

This report is confidential in accordance with section 10A (2) (c) (d) of the Local Government Act 1993 as the report contains information that would, if disclosed, confer a commercial advantage on a person with whom the Council is conducting (or proposes to conduct) business; AND the report contains commercial information of a confidential nature that would, if disclosed (i) prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied it; or (ii) confer a commercial advantage on a competitor of the Council; or (iii) reveal a trade secret.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Council moved into closed session at 8.42pm

16.1 Tender Exemption - Maintenance, Management of Multi-level Carparks and Cash Collection Services

RECOMMENDATION: Councillor MacLean and Councillor Noack

That Council:

- (a) approves the exemption to the tendering requirements for the maintenance, management of multi-level car parks and cash collection services pursuant to section 55(3)(k) of the *Local Government Act 1993*.
- (b) approves an extension of the existing contract with Point Parking (on the same terms and conditions) as the interim provider for a term of 12 months to enable a full tender process to be conducted in late 2024.
- (c) notes that Council is currently developing a Car Parking Strategy to guide decision-making regarding significant car parking matters and/or opportunities and that conducting a

tender process at this time without a Strategy could impose a significant risk to Council entering into unsatisfactory or potentially prejudicial car parking agreements.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

16.2 **LATE REPORT: ITT10-2023 - Supply and Installation Of New Multi-Level Carparking Technology and Maintenance Agreement**

(Report of Executive Director Finance and Information)

RECOMMENDATION: Councillor MacLean and Councillor Noack

That this item will be deferred until such time that further due diligence is undertaken by Council staff to obtain best value for money.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

PROCEDURAL MOTION RETURN TO OPEN SESSION

RECOMMENDATION: Councillor Noack and Councillor Bradley

That Council move into open session.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Note: Council Moved to Open Session at 9.05pm.

7. REPORTS OF RESOLUTIONS PASSED IN CLOSED SESSION

MOTION: Councillor MacLean and Councillor Noack

That the recommendation of the Closed Session in relation to Items:

- 16.1: **Tender Exemption - Maintenance, Management of Multi-level Carparks and Cash Collection Services;** and
- 16.2: **LATE REPORT: ITT10-2023 - Supply and Installation Of New Multi-Level Carparking Technology and Maintenance Agreement**

be received and noted as resolutions of Council without any alteration and amendment thereto.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

16.1 **Tender Exemption - Maintenance, Management of Multi-level Carparks and Cash Collection Services**

4680

RESOLVED: Councillor MacLean and Councillor Noack

That Council:

- (a) approves the exemption to the tendering requirements for the maintenance, management of multi-level car parks and cash collection services pursuant to section 55(3)(k) of the *Local Government Act 1993*.
- (b) approves an extension of the existing contract with Point Parking (on the same terms and conditions) as the interim provider for a term of 12 months to enable a full tender process to be conducted in late 2024.
- (c) notes that Council is currently developing a Car Parking Strategy to guide decision-making regarding significant car

parking matters and/or opportunities and that conducting a tender process at this time without a Strategy could impose a significant risk to Council entering into unsatisfactory or potentially prejudicial car parking agreements.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

16.2 **LATE REPORT: ITT10-2023 - Supply and Installation Of New Multi-Level Carparking Technology and Maintenance Agreement**

(Report of Executive Director Finance and Information)

4681

RESOLVED: Councillor MacLean and Councillor Noack

That this item will be deferred until such time that further due diligence is undertaken by Council staff to obtain best value for money.

Record of Voting:

For the Motion: Unanimous

Councillors Garrard and Pandey asked questions on Confidential Item 16.2 LATE REPORT: ITT10-2023 - Supply and Installation Of New Multi-Level Carparking Technology and Maintenance Agreement which was taken on notice.

Councillor Prociv asked when will the Online Petition website for Council will be available?

Note: A staff report will be brought back to the Chamber on questions taken on notice for Item 16.2 LATE REPORT: ITT10-2023 - Supply and Installation Of New Multi-Level Carparking Technology and Maintenance Agreement.

18. CONCLUSION OF MEETING

The meeting concluded at 9.07pm.

This page and the preceding 24 pages are the Minutes of the Ordinary Council Meeting held on Monday, 12 February 2024 and will be confirmed on Monday, 26 February 2024.



Chairperson