

MINUTES

Meeting Name	Heritage Advisory Committee	Quorum: 7
Date	Tuesday, 2 May 2023	Time: 5:00PM
Venue	Level 12 Boardroom, 126 Church Street, Parramatta / MS Teams	
Attendees	<p>Chairperson and Deputy Chair:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Graham Shirley (Acting Chairperson) <p>Committee Members</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Cheryl Bates - Jeff Allen (remote) - Laurie Bennett - Michele Grande (remote) - Scott Hill (remote) - Suzette Meade - Tim Owen (remote) - Wei Li (remote) <p>Council staff</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Andrea Giusa – DTSU Council’s Heritage Advisor • Issa Trad - Team Leader Land Use Planning • Paul Kennedy – Strategic Land Use Planning Project Officer • Robert Sutton – DTSU Technical Specialist Manager • Rachel Machkevitch – Project Officer Major Projects & Precincts • Belinda Borg – Team Leader Major Projects & Precincts <p>Guest</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Jillian Comber - Director of Comber Consultants Pty Ltd <p>Ex-Officio</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Councillor Angie Humphries (remote) • Councillor Phil Bradley (remote) 	
Apologies / Leave of Absence	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Stephanie Licciardo (Chair) - Julie Jones - Terrence Smith - Janelle Scully - Land Use Planning Manager - Mark Leotta - DTSU Group Manager 	
Secretariat	Vandana Saini	
HPRM Reference	F2022/01409	

No.	Item						
1.	Acknowledgement of Country <i>The City of Parramatta Council acknowledges the Burramattagal Clan of The Dharug, the traditional owners of land of Parramatta and pays its respects to the elders past, present and emerging.</i>						
2.	Welcome & Apologies The Chairperson Graham Shirley welcomed everyone to the meeting. The meeting opened at 5:00pm. The Committee received and noted the apologies from Committee members Stephanie Licciardo, Julie Jones and Terrence Smith.						
3.	Disclosure of Interests There were no declarations of interest made at the start of this meeting. Scott Hill declared a potential perceived conflict of interest for Agenda Item 8 - Planning Proposal – 9 Albert Street given near proximity to the nearby area Female Factory and wider site and MHNSW involvement in the area.						
4.	Confirmation of Minutes of meeting held on Tuesday, 7 March 2023 RESOLVED (Bates/Shirley) That the Minutes of Heritage Advisory Committee meeting held on Tuesday, 7 March 2023 be received and noted as a true record of the meeting.						
5.	Update on Local Heritage Fund (LHF) guidelines form on CoP website implementation.						
Description	The Committee was provided an update about the review of the Local Heritage Fund Guidelines and Application Forms. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Local heritage fund provides small grants to owners of heritage items and properties in conservation areas for work that will improve the heritage value of a property. • The review was conducted with support of Project Officer, Development & Traffic Services Unit (DTSU). • The new LHF guidelines and applications forms for Heritage Funding can be found on the link Local heritage fund City of Parramatta (nsw.gov.au) 						
Outcome	The Committee noted the updates.						
6.	Local Heritage Fund Applications (3 applications)						
Description	Andrea Giusa, DTSU Council's Heritage Advisor provided an update on the Local Heritage Fund Applications received. Background: Council's Local Heritage Fund provides small grants 25% of the total cost of works up to \$3,300 to owners of heritage items and properties located in conservation areas.						
<table border="1"> <tbody> <tr> <td>Total Budget</td> <td>\$35,500</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Available Fund for each of 3 meetings</td> <td>\$11,833</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Balance remaining from previous</td> <td>\$9,488.62</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Total Budget	\$35,500	Available Fund for each of 3 meetings	\$11,833	Balance remaining from previous	\$9,488.62
Total Budget	\$35,500						
Available Fund for each of 3 meetings	\$11,833						
Balance remaining from previous	\$9,488.62						

fund	
Total expenditure sought at tonight meeting	\$8,844.25
Remaining balance after tonight expenditure	\$644.25

Applications profile, statement of significance, scope of works was discussed at the meeting and the following recommendations were made:

Address	Works	Cost of Works	Amount approved	Move/Second
19-21 Wentworth Street Parramatta	Installation and replacement of awnings to improve heritage façade.	\$8,977.00	\$0 Not recommended for approval	Hill/Grande
76-78 Lanhams Road, Winston Hills	Remove overgrown Chinese Wisteria, shrubs and vines from street boundary, remove dilapidated low height paling fence and replace with new custom cut low paling fence to match original style and finishes	\$24,507 (invoice/receipts requested)	\$3,300 Recommended for approval	Bates/Hill
70 Ross Street North Parramatta	Repair of timber on front of the house gable.	\$28,260.00	\$3,300 Recommended for approval	Bates/Shirley

The Committee discussed the difference between installation of new awnings to a heritage item and replacement of an existing fencing on a heritage item. As a result of the conversation the awning is a new addition to the Heritage item and does not preserve the heritage presentation of the item (does not constitute a conservation work) while fencing replacement is an existing feature part of the Heritage item and that contributes to its public domain presentation and enhance its contributory significance to the HCA.

The first application presented did not meet the criteria of the funding and was therefore rejected not being a suitable scope for the purpose of the LHF and also considering that the applicant only provided a scope (quotation). This is not aligned with council's LHF guidelines as the works must be executed or completed to be assessed for the purpose of obtaining a grant.

Outcome The Committee approved total funding of \$6600.00 for the two suitable LHF applications with remaining balance of \$2888.62

7. Archaeological findings Parramatta presentation by Dr Jillian Comber.

Description Andrea Giusa welcomed Dr Jillian Comber, the Director of Comber Consultants Pty Ltd, who is an Archaeologist experienced in all aspects of Cultural Heritage Management including consulting, government and academia. Her firm recently celebrated a win in the Australian Enterprise Awards 2023.

She is qualified and experienced in Aboriginal and Historical archaeology and Cultural Heritage Management, including Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal (Historic) archaeological survey, significance assessment and the provision of management; recommendations; preparation of Conservation Management Plans and Statements of Heritage Impact.

Dr Comber gave a presentation on Parramatta Square's Aboriginal Heritage.

The key highlights of the presentation were:

- Journey from Market Place in 1813 to Parramatta Square in 2023
- Native Conference – Governor attended the annual meeting of the First Australians at Parramatta in 1826. The site of the marketplace was the site of Native Conferences.
- Archaeology – over 1,000 artefacts uncovered from the grounds of Parramatta Square. E.g., Backed blades, Spears, Hearths.
- The site of Parramatta Square was historically a resource rich area which would have been capable of supporting large numbers of people who may have met annually.
- The hearth dated to c1830, and the glass artefacts indicates that the site was still being used during the period of the Native Conferences when different clans would have been visiting the site.
- PS is a significant aboriginal archaeological site as it meets all Burra Charter criteria.
- The PS site was where the policy of the removal of children began.

Dr Comber concluded the presentation by recommending Council support in a submission for an application to consider the significance of Parramatta Square for first nation community and in support of a nomination as "Aboriginal Place".

Outcome The Committee found the presentation very insightful and thanked Dr Comber for sharing her knowledge. They also congratulated her for the recent win in the Australian Enterprise Awards 2023.

8. Matter arising from the previous minutes

Description Site specific planning proposal – 45 Macquarie Street Parramatta

Rachel Machkevitch gave a short presentation on 45 Macquarie Street Parramatta.

In November 2022, the Heritage Advisory Committee considered the Planning

Proposal and requested the following additional information from the applicant:

1. Provide reasoning to why it is necessary to reduce the existing LEP listing, and additionally, confirm what physical deposits, and what value exists outside the area of the proposed reduced listing.
2. Further details were sought to understand the archaeological significance of the remainder of the site with referred to the threshold for local significance as well at State significance.
3. Demonstrate how existing stratification of the site impacts the proposed reduced listing and vice -versa.

The Committee noted the response of the applicant as reviewed and supported by the Council Heritage Advisor:

1. That there is no surviving archaeology on the site beyond that now delineated in the SHR curtilage, therefore the additional area of LEP listing is incorrect to the extent that is in now redundant.
2. The above facts were confirmed by the location and coverage of the SHR listed area
3. There is no existing stratification remaining on the remainder of the site outside of the SHR listed area. All of the significant aspects of this listings relate to the outcome of this site investigations prior the development occurred and those have been retained and interpreted as part of the State Significant Archaeology heritage display centre integrated into the V by Crown development sited at 45 Macquarie St Parramatta. The SHI consider this curtilage appropriate as the archaeology potential of this site is contained within the boundary of the refenced SHR listed area.

The Committee accepted the response and understood that a review of the SHR and LEP listings confirms the site meets criteria for intangible values, but these all relate to the archaeology which is inside the SHR curtilage. As such, the reduction of the LEP listing to mirror the SHR curtilage is appropriate. The Committee recommends that the Council should verify the owner's response and also consider the following questions before changes under the Planning Proposal are supported:

1. Is it correct that the SHR boundary is the only place that contains physical relics?
2. Is their intangible value of local significance associated with the wider boundary for the Council listing, the LEP listing that should retain protection beyond the State Heritage register?

Planning Proposal – 9 Albert Street and 31 O'Connell Street, North Parramatta

Paul Kennedy presented the Planning Proposal (PP) at its preliminary stage of **assessment and sought the Committee's feedback/comments**. It is anticipated that the PP would be presented to the Local Planning Panel in the near future and to the Council thereafter.

The key highlights of the presentation to be considered for informed decision making were:

- The objective of the PP is to facilitate the development of the site for a high-density mixed-use development.

- The PP seeks to amend the existing maximum HoB to 66m and FSR to 4.4:1.
- The Heritage Advisor does not support the amended PP as it will have negative impact on the adjoining North Parramatta Conservation area.
- The site is located within the North Parramatta Place Strategy area. The strategy is being prepared by the DPE which will need to be considered in the assessment of the proposal.

The Committee unanimously agreed not to support the site specific PP for **9 Albert Street and 31 O'Connell Street, North Parramatta** because of following concerns:

- Proximity to and impact on the North Parramatta Heritage Area
- Premature because North Parramatta Place strategy not yet decided
- Traffic and parking issues
- Could impact on Aboriginal values

Could impact on and prejudice the proposed World Heritage listing of the Parramatta Female Factory. The question was raised whether advice from the Commonwealth Government was sought on this site- specific PP.

Criteria for local heritage listing

Paul Kennedy informed the Committee that heritage listing is determined by the NSW Government criteria for listing as outlined in Government guides and publications. An item is considered to be of local significance if it meets one or more criteria centred around the following: historical significance, aesthetic significance, scientific significance, and social significance. An item may also be able to be graded being of exceptional, rare or high significance. More information can be found on the Cop website.

<https://www.cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au/visiting/what-is-heritage/heritage-listings>

Number of recent heritage listings

The staff could not find evidence of new listings over the last five years but in the past few years approximately 8 potential listings have been identified. Normally, new listings would be pursued by one of two pathways. Housekeeping amendments, although these are generally listed to more minor matters and a comprehensive heritage review. The Committee was informed that Council staff would look at resources to see when a comprehensive review, that would also need Council endorsement, might be appropriate.

Outcome	Council staff to provide the Committee with further information on a comprehensive heritage review to include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The scope of a review. • The timeframe for a review. Cost estimate for a review.
9.	43 A Thomas Street Parramatta <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Update from CoPC and HNSW Brief presentation by Graham Shirley on latest historical information.
Description	Graham Shirley presented "The Broughton House (Campbell Verge House)".

<https://www.facebook.com/groups/312684935495543/posts/4404470736316922/>

The presentation was about the history, architecture, evolution and heritage significance of The Broughton House – 43A Thomas Street Parramatta. One of the resources of the information was from a blog written by Michael Organ <https://freewheelinobscurity.blogspot.com/2021/06/the-campbellverge-house-parramatta-1838.html>

Graham also shared an email from Michael Organ that requests Council to work towards the protection, preservation and ultimate restoration of the Campbell Verge House as it's an item of State significance.

Council staff informed the Committee that the property is a State Heritage item and has maximum protection at the state level. It is also Heritage listed under the LEP. In 2019, a heritage minor work application was submitted to the Council for certain Heritage emergency works and demolition of the two storeys verandah. The application was referred to the lodgement of a DA because of the implication of its cumulative impacts. The applicant chose not to lodge a development application with Council, instead the works occurred during the period 2020-2022 rely upon a s60 approval under the Heritage Act 1977 obtained from the Heritage NSW. The works were completed during the Covid-19 pandemic, this was verified by the Heritage Advisor and Compliance Advisor which in 2022 contacted HNSW and the builder to seek information following several concerns raised by the community and Councillors.

The Compliance Officer advised the Council's heritage advisor that under the Environmental Planning & Assessment Act 1979 Council cannot pursue legal action and that the applicant- have completed the works approved by the State Agency as the assessment authority for those minimal maintenance and repair. City of Parramatta Council understands the importance of advocacy for preserving such heritage items, however the local authority cannot act above the compliance and legislation.

The Committee discussed the possibilities of how such properties can be protected. Clarification about Council's abilities to pursue a legal or enforcement action have been provided to the members. In the event of illegal works Council can intervene, or when the subject property presents hazard, risk or danger to the Community.

The Committee thanked Graham Shirley for sharing the valuable history of the "The Broughton House (Campbell Verge House) ".

Outcome Resolved (Bennett/Grande)

That Council approach the State Government and other appropriate Heritage departments to amend the legislation in the way it would assist the local government in enforcing minimal maintenance of significant heritage items that are both locally and State listed.

10. General Business/information

- Parramatta as a heritage tourist destination
- Heritage and Conservation – Parramatta council web pages updates

including introduction of Virtual tours

Cheryl Bates clarified her question. The aim was to bring Parramatta Council's Heritage to a world class destination and there are not resources or initiative to make this possible.

The Committee had an open discussion regarding promoting Parramatta's Heritage and recommended as below:

Resolved (Owen/Bates)

1. That the Parramatta Heritage Committee recommends that "Parramatta" as a place be nominated for National Heritage Listing. A proposed curtilage could encompass the key known First Nations and historical heritage items.
 2. Further that, the Parramatta Heritage Committee recommends that Parramatta City Council, the Hon. Donna Davis (as the local State member), the Hon. Penny Sharpe (as the NSW State minister for heritage), and the Hon. John Graham (as the NSW State minister for tourism and jobs) commence a program on the promotion and furtherment of heritage tourism. The program should work with existing major heritage destinations (operated by PPT, FF, NT etc) and consider different sectors of tourism - including school groups, families, weekenders, and deep dive history tourists. Special programs should be developed for residents of the Council area, such as a 'locals' card, and seek to draw-in people from neighbouring LGAs, notably those linked through sustainable and accessible modes of transport e.g., the ferry or train.
- 2 Macquarie Street Parramatta – Updates on DA/813/2013/E condition 15 for the fence restoration.

The Heritage Advisor provided an update on the fence restoration. An investigation was conducted and also multiple site visits, it was determined that the restoration works were approved as part of the notice of determination conditions. The submitted additional documentation provided to Council in 2019 did not include the methodology for this restoration. As a result, the stone plinths and wrought iron fence was removed from its site and restored with many elements being rebuilt/replaced. The Committee was concerned that due to negligence (conservation management plan overlooked) an 1880's fence was demolished, and such works requests should be scrutinised in detail before approval. Cheryl Bates stated that this instance is unfortunate and constitute harm towards Parramatta heritage, the loss is not acceptable, and this case is a lesson to avoid any future loss of significant heritage for Parramatta.

- Conflict of interest

The agenda includes all the addresses of developments and LHF application.

- Parameters of SEPP for infrastructure

Robert Sutton shared the response from Mark Leotta with the Committee. The aims of the SEPP are highlighted in Chapter 2.1 of the infrastructure SEPP.

- Filling two HAC members.

As per the Terms of Reference of HAC

Specific Membership Criteria

3.22 The Committee will comprise such members as are appointed by Council from time to time, including: a. A minimum of eight (8) and a maximum of fourteen (14) members meeting the following criteria: - demonstrate skills and capacity to contribute to the Committee; and
- live, work, study or have a strong commitment to the City of Parramatta LGA; and
- be an employee or member of an organisation whose primary function relates to the preservation of heritage.

Member Vacancies

4.9 Where a vacancy occurs: a. Within six (6) months from the appointment of members, the vacancy may be filled firstly by a person on the eligibility list if they are still interested and available to join the Heritage Advisory Committee; or
b. After six (6) months from the appointment of members, and more than 12 months from the end of the Heritage Advisory Committee's term, an Expression of Interest utilising Council, Community and Committee members' networks should be undertaken.

4.10 Vacancies will not normally be filled within the last 12 months of a Heritage Advisory Committee term.

Governance has considered the clauses above and recommended that the Committee can continue with the current membership of 12 members and quorum of 7 members at a meeting. In case there are more vacant positions then the EOI will be undertaken.

11.

Next agenda Item:

- Email from Laurie Bennett will be circulated to the Committee to be considered at the next meeting.

The Acting Chairperson, Graham Shirley and staff thanked Committee Members and guests for their attendance and their participation.

Meeting Closed: 8:40pm.

Next Meeting Date: 4 July 2023
